



British Caving Association

Draft Minutes of the Qualifications Management Committee meeting held on 25th September 2017 at the British Caving Library

1. Present

Graham Mollard	(GM)	Chair QMC
Nigel Ball	(NB)	ALO Northern England Panel
Gethin Thomas	(GT)	ALO North Wales Panel
Rich Hill	(RH)	ALO South Wales Panel
David Hollingham	(DH)	AHOEC
Mary Wilde	(MW)	Training Administrator
Stephan Natynczuk	(SN)	ALO Southern Panel
Phil Baker	(PB)	CIC Chairman
Dave Baines	(DB)	ALO Derbyshire Panel
Juliet Parker-Smith	(J P-S)	CIC Panel Rep
Andy Eavis	(AE)	BCA Chair and Exec Rep

Apologies

Nick Williams	(NW)	E&T Council Rep
Tony Radmall	(TR)	ASCT

- Abbreviations**
- T/A *Trainer Assessor*
 - T/Adv *Technical Advisor*
 - TC *Training Committee*
 - QMC *British Caving Association Qualification Management Committee (previously NCP)*

Meeting commenced at 10:30 am.

2. Action Register and Matters Arising.

Action Register

The action register was updated.

No	Action	Who	By	Done
	03/02/15			
106	The NCP propose that the LCMLA Handbook be rewritten as a slimmer version and this will be their recommendation to the next TC. Update 28/04/15 NB: This has been discussed at TC. Gary Evans has access to funding and he may be willing to write it. Update 15/12/2015 it was agreed to take a modular approach Update 24/11/2016 L1 ropework nearly complete. L2 rope work and Geology commenced.	Various	Ongoing	Ongoing



British Caving Association

Draft Minutes of the Qualifications Management Committee meeting held on 25th September 2017 at the British Caving Library

	Update 12/06/2017 Ongoing Update 25/09/2017 Index to be added and then it can be published. Thanks to RH for his work on this document.			
	28/04/5			
113	Produce Caving Award for Children document. Update 03/03/2016 No progress SN not present. Update 24/11/2016 SN working with Mel Sugden on this. Update 12/06/2017 GM to put SN in touch with MS Update 25/09/2017 No progress	SN/MS	ASAP	Ongoing
115	NCP to rewrite the LCLMA syllabus to include Tyroleans. Update 15/12/2015 Discussed but no conclusion drawn Update 24/11/2016 Much work carried out but a few changes to be made Update 09/03/2017 Acknowledged that this is a good document and training resource. Update 12/06/2017 RH has improved photos. GM asked for volunteer to produce draft doc on risk assessment, risk management and hazards. J P-S volunteered. Update 22/09/2017 Cover picture needs to mirror 'weather and flooding' style. This will be a separate module available to LMCLA L2 or CIC.	GT J-PS	ASAP	Ongoing
116	Modularisation of LCML syllabus. Update 25/09/2016 Ongoing.	NB	ASAP	Ongoing
	23/09/2016			
131	DB to work with JC and CJ on Cornwall mines training. Update 24/11/2016 NW has contacts in Cornwall and will work with DB Update 12/06/2017 No update Update 25/09/2017 DB CJ and JC taking this on. DB to contact Nick Willis to progress.	DB / NW		Ongoing
	24/11/2016			
138	GM to take the new proposal on membership to the BCA council. Update 12/06/2017 Covered as agenda item. Update 25/09/2017 No direct progress but permit issue has arisen. CNCC do not recognise QMC so wont issues permits. AE to write to CNCC. J P-S again raised SW access issue.	GM	ASAP	Ongoing
144	DB to circulate the document on National Trust access charges. Update 12/06/2017 No update Update 25/09/2017 No further action required.	DB	Next Meeting	Discharged.
	09/03/2017			



British Caving Association

Draft Minutes of the Qualifications Management Committee meeting
held on 25th September 2017 at the British Caving Library

148	MW to add email addresses to dates form. Update 25/09/2017 Complete	MW	ASAP	Discharged
150	GM to write to NCS to raise concerns re impact and safety. Update 25/09/2017 Done but no response.	GM	Next Meeting	Active
152	MW to place the incident reporting form on the website Update 12/06/2017 MW to place on website and send to all T/As. Update 25/09/2017 Done. All make sure it is used but note that positive side of this to be emphasised to gain trust.	MW	ASAP	Discharged.
12/06/2017				
153	GM to circulate L2 ropework document Update 25/09/2017 Documented has been started and will be shared.	GM	ASAP	Active
155	MW to create a change notice regarding 'in house' training and assessment. Update 25/09/2017 Complete	MW	ASAP	Discharged.
156	GM to create role descriptions for QMC officers Update 25/09/2017 covered in agenda	GM	ASAP	Active
157	MW to pull together a list of issues to be resolved before compulsory membership is introduced Update 25/09/2017 Some input but on hold pending admins system finalisation.	MW	ASAP	Active
158	GM to check the position on insurance regarding action 157. Update 25/09/2017 As 157	GM	ASAP	Discharged.
159	MW to raise a change notice regarding moderation/T/A workshops/peer to peer Update 25/09/2017 covered in agenda	MW	Before 01/01/2018	Active
160	RH will draft a note on 'cic pre-assessment day' for PB Update 25/09/2017 to be discuss at CIC meeting 26/09	RH	Before next meeting	Active
161	RH to send me the abridged Descent article for Andy Eavis. Published Update 25/09/2017 Complete	RH	ASAP	Discharged.
162	MW to raise a change notice regarding update workshop ratios. Update 25/09/2017 Complete	MW	ASAP	Discharged
163	MW to sort the paperwork for the new TA Update 25/09/2017 Complete	MW	ASAP	Discharged
164	MW to raise a change notice on cows tails Update 25/09/2017 wording to be altered to reflect that it applies when acting as an instructor.	MW	ASAP	Active
165	GT is to draft a candidate feedback form. Update 25/09/2017. Form issued. BCA logo to be added. Questions to be refined and trialled for a year. Note that output will be anonymous.	GT	Next meeting	Active



British Caving Association

Draft Minutes of the Qualifications Management Committee meeting
held on 25th September 2017 at the British Caving Library

25/09/2017				
166	PB will send the CIC scoring scheme to MW to circulate to all QMC members.	PB/MW	ASAP	Active
167	All to send feedback on the chair job description to GM	ALL	Before next meeting	Active
168	MW will work with PB to agree wording regarding weaknesses for Section 5 and CIC certificates.	MW/PB	Before next meeting	Active
169	SN to send update dates to MW urgently	SN	ASAP	Active
170	GM is to create a note for T/As on the issue of changing venues for assessment	GM	ASAP	Active
171	J P-S to write to the council again on the topic of access	J P-S	ASAP	Active
172	AE to write to the CNCC/landowner regarding permits	AE	ASAP	Active

3. Minutes of the Last Meeting

3.1 line 5 should read:

'PB suggested the post should be open to everyone to make it an open process and that it should involve re-advertising after a set time period. J P-S agreed with this as she was anxious to ensure it was a fair and transparent process'

Also in same paragraph:

'GM will create role descriptions and circulate' as this is what was agreed. This should be reflected in action 156

J P-S asked to be added to the list of those present.

8. Cow's Tails - should say 'Must have a locking gate crab when working as an instructor'
MW to issue updated change notice.

With these changes the minutes were accepted as a true record. Other matters arising covered on the agenda and in the action register.

4. CIC Report (PB)



British Caving Association

Draft Minutes of the Qualifications Management Committee meeting
held on 25th September 2017 at the British Caving Library

There was not much to report as the CIC meeting was scheduled for the day after QMC. The panel members will be going caving after their meeting. There are two assessments in progress at present and one Core Skills Reassessment. PB presented the stats and it was noted that registrations were down this year. MW added that they generally pick up after September and there is one in the pipeline. It was also noted that there was an unusual rise in income in 2015. This was due to the number of update workshops which go in a three year cycle. MW said that in 2018 there would be a hump in both CIC and LCMLA update workshops.

5. Problems Facing GM regarding T/As

GM circulated his report and time was taken to read and digest it. In general it was felt that more time was needed to consider these important issues and suggestions.

5.1 Scoring

GM had proposed a similar scoring scheme for LCMLA. DB asked GM to expand on what he thought was inconsistent about the scheme. GB said he has had feedback highlighting massive differences in content of courses delivered by different T/As. He feels that scoring would reduce pass/fail discrepancies. Geology is a topic that appears to be covered inconsistently and PB said that it is important for people to understand the processes not just the terminology. SN asked what the purpose of a points system is when it is a pass/fail result. J P-S said that points systems allow people to know how well they are doing and to aim at higher achievement. This could also be related to the sites that appear on their certificates. Where action plans are created it would be essential for T/As to have access to them as T/As assess different modules. RH said that much work is needed to take this forward. The general feeling of the meeting on this topic was positive. PB will send the CIC scoring scheme to MW to circulate to all QMC members.

5.2 Action Plans

GM proposed that action plans should be created at assessment with monitoring to ensure that the plans are carried out. J P-S said that this would take a lot of resource and that update workshops are resource heavy already. GM accepted that this would need to be considered. A discussion took place regarding which party suffers if award holders are deemed to be weak – the award holder, their employer or the BCA. J P-S and PB felt that it



British Caving Association

Draft Minutes of the Qualifications Management Committee meeting held on 25th September 2017 at the British Caving Library

would reflect upon the individual and their employer rather than the BCA, but GM disagreed. He was also concerned about the legal position. DH asked if all candidates would have an action plan and GM replied that they would not, only those with weaknesses. PB said that weaknesses should be covered on the written report and NB said it was the individual's responsibility to keep up to date. (This topic comes up again later under moderation).

5.3 QMC Chair Job Description

A copy of the proposed job description was circulated and some surprise was expressed about its scope. GM stated that the job was hard and that he carries out all the items listed. SN was anxious that we should not scare off a potential deputy. PB and J P-S said that we need a separate job description for the deputy. GT said that the fact that it is voluntary would need to be mentioned along with the term of office. Feedback is to be send to GM before the next meeting. GM also asked for opinions on the name of his role. Development officer and General Secretary were suggested but no conclusion reached.

J P-S thanked GM for submitting the ideas on scoring, action plans and the job description.

5.4 Why we should train and assess at a much higher level than our candidates operational level.

Initially this generated a discussion on cave access in South Wales and in general. AE suggested that J PS writes to council about it – but she replied that they had done this before with no result. It is wrong that some BCA members were in a position to deny our ability to train our members. AE said she should write again as he was now much clearer about the issues involved.

GT said that we need to train at the highest level of the qualification bit it is hard to define. GM said you need to be competent at a level higher than that at which you train. PB said that this is carried out at CIC.

5.5 New way for marking L 1 and L2 assessments.

Covered in previous item



British Caving Association

Draft Minutes of the Qualifications Management Committee meeting
held on 25th September 2017 at the British Caving Library

6. Moderation, T/A workshops, Updates and peer to peer reviews - clarification needed.

GT said that if some people are operating at sub-standard levels a course feedback form may help identify any shortcomings. All handbook work is leading to improved consistency. GM asked if we should we run skills fade workshops. GT asked if sites can be removed from tickets and everyone agreed that this can and does happen in LCMLA. PB will draw up a form of words to explain that it is the responsibility of the leader to ensure weaknesses are address. MW will work with PB to agree wording for Section 5 and CIC certificates.

7. L1 / L2 rope work (GM)

Level 1 rope work document is complete. GM presented some thoughts on the Level 2 rope work, MW will email it to all once she receives a copy of the document for discussion at the next meeting.

8. Regional Panel Reports

8.1 South Wales (RH)

FoD sites list is still with John Crowsley to refine. Tom Peacock has moved from the SW panel to the NE panel. One probationary T/A asked for confirmation regarding his observations completion time limit. (MW later confirmed that a reply had been sent in June but that she will write a letter now too).

8.2 N Wales (GT)

The panel raised an issue regarding the duration of training courses that include Tyroleans. Two days is too short and an additional evening session is required. A discussion about whether this should be a separate module like SRT took place. It was suggested that there could be a third optional day – but it was felt that this moves away from standardising courses across panels. It was decided to run it and use the feedback to assess if it should be separate module like SRT.

8.3 S England (SN)

The next panel meeting is in November. Happy to have FOD but the site list needs updating. The idea of peer to peer was well received. Access continues to be a problem. The Via Ferrata in in Wookey Hole was discussed but this may be outside the remit of our scheme, although GM noted it uses the same skills, and SN indicated the Via Ferrata was rigged on rope not cable. MW asked for update dates urgently.

8.4 N England NB

Draft QMC Minutes 170925 V1



British Caving Association

Draft Minutes of the Qualifications Management Committee meeting
held on 25th September 2017 at the British Caving Library

No feedback as panel meeting had not taken place. The issue of obtaining permits from the CNCC needs to be resolved and they don't recognise the QMC. Andy Hine needs to sort out this issue. PB asked for a letter to be sent from the exec to the land owner.

8.5 Derbys DB

Should L2 assessments move to a ratio of 1 to 1? After a discussion and in order to ensure standards across panels, it was decided that

- Mod 3 can be 1 to 2.
- Mod 3 and 5 combined should be 1 to 1.

The panel is running a technical workshop at Dukes Barn soon.

Rising traverse lines were discussed, and GT said at times, there would be a need to be belayed up these.

9. TAs – New, changed, resigned.

Martin Barry has stood down as a T/A

An application from a CIC to be accepted as a probationary T/A was discussed and agreed with all in favour.

GM stated that he was unwilling to attend N England panel meeting due to personal abuse issues. But he agreed to go to the next one as Nigel intends to put a new control mechanism in place to prevent issues.

MW said that some probationary T/As would reach the deadline to complete their observations before the next meeting. GM said that if they fail to complete these they would no longer be probationary T/As and would need to reapply if they wished to continue.

10. AOB

10.1 J P-S said an issue had occurred regarding the alteration of an L2 Mod 4 venue.

Although this was resolved GM is to create a note for T/As on the issue.

10.2 GT suggested we should run a workshop on Tyroleans.

10.3 GM raised the issue of Co2 levels in caves and said that tests are going on. AE said that we need to ensure that this and the symptoms it causes are included in the scheme.

The Meeting closed at 15:45

Next Meetings



British Caving Association

Draft Minutes of the Qualifications Management Committee meeting
held on 25th September 2017 at the British Caving Library

26/02/2018 (Corrected from 26/01/2018)

11/06/2018

24/09/2018

DRAFT